

Ref

OPINIONS AND DECLARATIONS RENDERED BY THE INTER- NATIONAL COMMISSION ON ZOOLOGICAL NOMENCLATURE

Edited by

FRANCIS HEMMING, C.M.G., C.B.E.

Secretary to the Commission

VOLUME 11. Part 10. Pp. 151—160

OPINION 360

Validation under the Plenary Powers of the specific
name *knorrii* Voltz, 1828, as published in the combination
Ostrea knorrii (Class Pelecypoda)



LONDON :

Printed by Order of the International Trust for
Zoological Nomenclature
and

Sold on behalf of the International Commission on Zoological
Nomenclature by the International Trust at its Publications Office
41, Queen's Gate, London, S.W.7
1955

Price Five Shillings

(All rights reserved)

INTERNATIONAL COMMISSION ON ZOOLOGICAL NOMENCLATURE

COMPOSITION AT THE TIME OF THE ADOPTION OF THE RULING GIVEN IN OPINION 360

A. The Officers of the Commission

Honorary Life President : Dr. Karl Jordan (*British Museum (Natural History),
Zoological Museum, Tring, Herts., England*)

President : Professor James Chester Bradley (*Cornell University, Ithaca, N.Y.,
U.S.A.*) (12th August 1953)

Vice-President : Senhor Dr. Afranio do Amaral (*Sao Paulo, Brazil*) (12th
August 1953)

Secretary : Mr. Francis Hemming (*London, England*) (27th July 1948)

B. The Members of the Commission

(*Arranged in order of precedence by reference to date of election or of most recent
re-election, as prescribed by the International Congress of Zoology*)

Professor H. BOSCHMA (*Rijksmuseum van Natuurlijke Historie, Leiden, The
Netherlands*) (1st January 1947)

Senor Dr. Angel CABRERA (*Eva Peron, F.C.N.G.R., Argentina*) (27th July 1948)

Mr. Francis HEMMING (*London, England*) (27th July 1948) (*Secretary*)

Dr. Joseph PEARSON (*Tasmanian Museum, Hobart, Tasmania, Australia*) (27th
July 1948)

Dr. Henning LEMCHE (*Universitetets Zoologiske Museum, Copenhagen, Denmark*)
(27th July 1948)

Professor Teiso ESAKI (*Kyushu University, Fukuoka, Japan*) (17th April
1950)

Professor Pierre BONNET (*Université de Toulouse, France*) (9th June 1950)

Mr. Norman Denbigh RILEY (*British Museum (Natural History), London*) (9th
June 1950)

Professor Tadeusz JACZEWSKI (*Institute of Zoology, Polish Academy of Sciences,
Warsaw, Poland*) (15th June 1950)

Professor Robert MERTENS (*Natur-Museum u. Forschungs-Institut Senckenberg,
Frankfurt a. M., Germany*) (5th July 1950)

Professor Erich MARTIN HERING (*Zoologisches Museum der Humboldt-Universität
zu Berlin, Germany*) (5th July 1950)

Senhor Dr. Afranio do AMARAL (*S. Paulo, Brazil*) (12th August 1953) (*Vice-
President*)

Professor J. R. DYMOND (*University of Toronto, Toronto, Canada*) (12th August
1953)

Professor J. Chester BRADLEY (*Cornell University, Ithaca, N.Y., U.S.A.*) (12th
August 1953) (*President*)

Professor Harold E. VOKES (*Johns Hopkins University, Baltimore, Maryland,
U.S.A.*) (12th August 1953)

Professor Béla HANKÓ (*Mezőgazdasági Múzeum Budapest, Hungary*) (12th
August 1953)

Dr. Norman R. STOLL (*Rockefeller Institute for Medical Research, New York,
N.Y., U.S.A.*) (12th August 1953)

Mr. P. C. SYLVESTER-BRADLEY (*Sheffield University, Sheffield, England*) (12th
August 1953)

Dr. L. B. HOLTHUIS (*Rijksmuseum van Natuurlijke Historie, Leiden, The Nether-
lands*) (12th August 1953)

OPINION 360

VALIDATION UNDER THE PLENARY POWERS OF THE SPECIFIC NAME "KNORRII" VOLTZ, 1828, AS PUBLISHED IN THE COMBINATION "OSTREA KNORRII" (CLASS PELECYPODA)

RULING :—(1) Under the Plenary Powers (a) the specific name *knorri* Defrance, 1821, as published in the combination *Ostrea knorri*, is hereby suppressed for the purposes both of the Law of Priority and of the Law of Homonymy, and (b) the junior homonym *knorrii* Voltz, 1828, as published in the combination *Ostrea knorrii*, is hereby validated.

(2) The under-mentioned specific name is hereby placed on the *Official Index of Rejected and Invalid Specific Names in Zoology* with the Name No. 128 :—*knorri* Defrance, 1821, as published in the combination *Ostrea knorri*, as suppressed under the Plenary Powers under (1) (a) above.

(3) The under-mentioned specific name is hereby placed on the *Official List of Specific Names in Zoology* with the Name No. 500 :—*knorrii* Voltz, 1828, as published in the combination *Ostrea knorrii*, as validated under the Plenary Powers under (1) (b) above.

I.—THE STATEMENT OF THE CASE

On 5th October 1951, Mr. P. C. Sylvester-Bradley (*Sheffield University, Sheffield, England*) submitted the following application for the validation of the specific name *knorrii* Voltz, 1828, as

NOV 28 1955

published in the combination *Ostrea knorrii*, a name very widely applied to an abundant oyster in the Bathonian of Western Europe :—

Proposed use of the Plenary Powers to validate the trivial name “knorri” Voltz, 1828, as published in the combination “*Ostrea knorrii*” (Class Pelecypoda)

By P. C. SYLVESTER-BRADLEY, B.Sc.

(University of Sheffield, Department of Geology, Sheffield, England)

The small ribbed oyster, abundant in the Bathonian of Switzerland, Germany, France and England, and known as *Ostrea knorri*, has been extensively quoted under that name in the palaeontological and stratigraphical literature of all four countries for 120 years, as also in geological textbooks (for examples, see Arkell, 1934 : 18—23).

2. In Lorraine, in Switzerland, and in Germany, the oyster has been used as a stratigraphical index, such terms as “couches à *knorri*” or “Knorrishichten” occurring frequently in stratigraphical literature.

3. In 1887 de Grossouvre (: 516) pointed out that the name *Ostrea knorri* Voltz, 1828, was a junior homonym of *O. knorri* Defrance 1821. He proposed the new name *O. lotharingica* for “*Ostrea knorri* Voltz in Zieten”. De Grossouvre’s name has been adopted very seldom since its publication.

4. Lissajous (1923 : 143) agreed that *O. knorri* Voltz was invalid, but considered the name *O. gibriaci* Martin, 1863, to be synonymous and therefore used it in preference to *O. lotharingica* de Grossouvre, 1887. Most previous and subsequent authors believed *O. gibriaci* to be distinct from *O. knorri*. The name has therefore not been adopted as a substitute for *O. knorri*.

5. Rollier (1911 : 272) made *O. knorri* Voltz the type of a new sub-genus, *Catinula*.

6. The oyster *O. knorri* Defrance, 1821, has long been recognised as a synonym of *O. gryphoides* Schlotheim, 1813. Consequently the name is never used, and no nomenclatural confusion could arise if it were to be suppressed.

7. Arkell (1934 : 17) stated the nomenclatorial position as here set out, and continued to use the name *O. knorri* Voltz.

8. Cox and Arkell (1948 : 20), in a nomenclatural revision of Bathonian mollusca, were bound by the Rules to adopt the name *O. lotharingica* for this oyster, but Dr. Arkell supports the present application to validate *O. knorri* Voltz.

9. In view of the fact that this oyster has such stratigraphical importance over so wide an area, I would urge that the name by which it is universally known stands in special need of protection. Hence I am proposing that the Commission use their Plenary Powers to suppress the name *O. knorri* Defrance, thus validating *O. knorri* Voltz.

10. The name *O. lotharingica* de Grossouvre was proposed, not as a substitute for "*O. knorri* Voltz", but for "*O. knorri* Voltz in Zieten". The oysters described by Zieten (1832 : 60, pl. xlv) under this name, from Geisingen in Germany, while close to the types of *O. knorri* from Muttens in Switzerland, possess certain morphological differences, and may come from a different horizon. Should the name *O. knorri* Voltz be validated, therefore, it would be possible to argue that the name *O. lotharingica* applied to an allied but different species, when both names would stand. Hence it is not proposed that the name *O. lotharingica* be placed on the *Official Index of Rejected and Invalid Specific Trivial Names in Zoology*.

11. The recommendations that I now submit are, therefore, that the International Commission on Zoological Nomenclature should :—

- (1) use the Plenary Powers to suppress the trivial name *knorri* Defrance, 1821, as published in the combination *Ostrea knorri* ;
- (2) place the foregoing trivial name on the *Official Index of Rejected and Invalid Specific Trivial Names in Zoology* ; and
- (3) place the trivial name *knorri* Voltz, 1828, as published in the combination *Ostrea knorrii*, on the *Official List of Specific Trivial Names in Zoology*.

References

- Arkell, W. J., 1934. The Oysters of the Fuller's Earth ; and on the Evolution and Nomenclature of the Upper Jurassic Catinulas and Gryphaeas. *Proc. Cottesw. Nat. F.C.*, **25** : 21—68.
- Cox, L. R. and Arkell, W. J., 1948. A Survey of the Mollusca of the British Great Oolite Series. *Palaeont. Soc.* : 20.
- Defrance, M. J. L., 1821. Huitre, *Ostrea*. *Dict. Sci. Nat.* **22** : 1—33.
- Grossouvre, A. de, 1887. Sur le système oolithique inférieur dans la partie occidentale du bassin de Paris. *Bull. Soc. géol. France*, (3) **15** : 516.

- Lissajous, M., 1923. Étude sur la faune du Bathonien des environs de Mâcon. *Trav. Lab. Géol. Fac. Sci. Lyon.*, Mém. 3.
- Martin, J., 1863. Notes sur quelques fossiles nouveaux ou peu connus de l'étage bathonien de la Côte-d'Or. *Mém. Acad. Imp. Dijon*, (2) 10, Sect. Sci : 66, 67, pl. 5, figs. 16—23.
- Rollier, L., 1911. Les faciès du Dogger ou Oolithique dans de Jura et les régions voisines. *Mém. publié par la fondation Schuyder von Wartensee à Zurich*.
- Voltz, P. L., 1828. Topographische Uebersicht der Mineralogie der beiden Rhein-Departemente ; in Aufschlager, Das Elsass, Supplement : 60.
- Zieten, C. H. von, 1832. Die Versteinerungen Württembergs : 60, pl. 45, figs. 2 a-d d.

II.—THE SUBSEQUENT HISTORY OF THE CASE

2. Registration of the present application : Upon the receipt of Mr. Sylvester-Bradley's application the question of the use of the Plenary Powers for the purpose of validating the specific name *knorrii* Voltz, 1828, as published in the combination *Ostrea knorrii*, was allotted the Registered Number Z.N.(S.) 626.

3. Publication of the present application : The present application was sent to the printer on 30th January 1952 and was published in the *Bulletin of Zoological Nomenclature* on 22nd May of that year (Sylvester-Bradley, 1952, *Bull. zool. Nomencl.* 6 : 201—202).

4. Issue of Public Notices : Under the revised procedure prescribed by the Thirteenth International Congress of Zoology, Paris, 1948 (1950, *Bull. zool. Nomencl.* 4 : 51—56), Public Notice of the possible use by the International Commission on Zoological Nomenclature of its Plenary Powers in the present case was given on 22nd May 1952 (a) in Part 7 of volume 6 of the *Bulletin of Zoological Nomenclature* (the Part in which Mr. Sylvester-Bradley's application was published) and (b) to the other prescribed serial publications. In addition, such Public Notice was given also to a number of general zoological serial publications and to certain palaeontological serials in Europe and America.

5. No objections received : The issue of the Public Notices specified in paragraph 4 above elicited no objection to the action proposed.

6. Two supplementary points submitted to the Commission in March 1954 : When preparing on 8th March 1954 the explanatory notes to be submitted to the Commission concurrently with the issue of a Voting Paper on the present case, Mr. Hemming as Secretary, included the following note (as Note 4), in which he drew attention to two supplementary points which would need to be considered by the Commission when voting on the present case :—

4. *Two minor points to be noted :* It must be noted (1) that the proposed suppression of the name *knorrii* Defrance is “for the purposes both of the Law of Priority and of the Law of Homonymy” (a point not stated in express terms in the application), and (2) that, in view of the decision on page 54 of *Copenhagen Decisions zool. Nomencl.*, regarding specific names based on modern patronymics, the name published by Voltz must be cited as “*knorrii*” and not as “*knorri*”.¹

III.—THE DECISION TAKEN BY THE INTERNATIONAL COMMISSION ON ZOOLOGICAL NOMENCLATURE

7. Issue of Voting Paper V.P.(54)28 : On 17th March 1954, a Voting Paper (V.P.(54)28) was issued in which the Members of the Commission were invited to vote either for, or against, “the proposal relating to the name *knorrii* Voltz, 1828, as

¹ At the time of the submission of the application dealt with in the present *Opinion* the *Règles* provided, under a decision taken by the Thirteenth International Congress of Zoology, Paris, 1948 (1950, *Bull. zool. Nomencl.* 4 : 68) that an infringement of the provisions of Article 14, such as the addition of a double letter “i” in place of a single “i” to a modern patronymic when forming a specific name in the genitive singular, was to be subject to automatic correction by later authors. Accordingly, in the present application the specific name *knorrii* published by Voltz in 1828 was corrected to *knorri*. The foregoing provision was amended by the Fourteenth International Congress of Zoology, Copenhagen, 1953, which substituted for it a provision that “in such a case the terminations ‘-i’ and ‘-ii’ are permissible variants, the differences between them having no nomenclatorial significance” (Decision 91).

published in the combination *Ostrea knorrii*, as set out in paragraph 11 on page 202 of volume 6 of the *Bulletin of Zoological Nomenclature* [i.e. in paragraph 11 of the application reproduced in the first paragraph of the present *Opinion*], subject to the two adjustments noted in paragraph 4 overleaf" [i.e. in the note reproduced in paragraph 6 of the present *Opinion*].

8. The Prescribed Voting Period : As the foregoing Voting Paper was issued under the Three-Month Rule, the Prescribed Voting Period closed on 17th June 1954.

9. Particulars of the Voting on Voting Paper V.P.(54)28 : The state of the voting on Voting Paper V.P.(54)28 at the close of the Prescribed Voting Period was as follows :—

(a) *Affirmative Votes had been given by the following nineteen (19) Commissioners (arranged in the order in which Votes were received) :*

Riley ; Sylvester-Bradley ; Holthuis ; Vokes ; Hering ; Bonnet ; Boschma ; Lemche ; Dymond ; do Amaral ; Esaki ; Mertens ; Jaczewski ; Hemming ; Bradley (J.C.) ; Hankó ; Pearson ; Stoll ; Cabrera.

(b) *Negative Votes :*

None ;

(c) *Voting Papers not returned :*

None.

10. Declaration of Result of Vote : On 18th June 1954, Mr. Hemming, Secretary to the International Commission, acting as Returning Officer for the Vote taken on Voting Paper

V.P.(54)28, signed a Certificate that the Votes cast were as set out in paragraph 9 above and declaring that the proposal submitted in the foregoing Voting Paper had been duly adopted and that the decision so taken was the decision of the International Commission in the matter aforesaid.

11. Preparation of the Ruling given in the present “ Opinion ” :

On 17th February 1955, Mr. Hemming prepared the Ruling given in the present *Opinion* and at the same time signed a Certificate that the terms of that Ruling were in complete accord with those of the proposal approved by the International Commission in its Vote on Voting Paper V.P.(54)28.

12. Original references : The following are the original references for the names placed on *Official Lists* and *Official Indexes* by the Ruling given in the present *Opinion* :—

knorri, *Ostrea*, DeFrance, 1821, *Dict. Sci. Inst.* **22** : 27

knorrii, *Ostrea*, Voltz, 1828, *Topograph. Uebersicht Min. beid. Rhein-Depart.* : 60

13. As the present *Opinion* is concerned only with a specific name, no question relating to family-group names arises in the present case.

14. At the time of the submission of the application dealt with in the present *Opinion*, the expression prescribed for the second portion of the binomen which constitutes the scientific name of a species was the expression “ trivial name ” and the *Official List* reserved for recording such names was styled the *Official List of Specific Trivial Names in Zoology*, the word “ trivial ” appearing also in the title of the *Official Index* reserved for recording rejected and invalid names of this category. Under a decision taken by the Fourteenth International Congress of Zoology, Copenhagen, 1953, the expression “ specific name ” was substituted for the expression “ trivial name ” and corresponding changes were made in the titles of the *Official List*

and *Official Index* of such names (1953, *Copenhagen Decisions zool. Nomencl.* : 21). The changes in terminology so adopted have been incorporated in the Ruling given in the present *Opinion*.

15. The prescribed procedures were duly complied with by the International Commission on Zoological Nomenclature in dealing with the present case, and the present *Opinion* is accordingly hereby rendered in the name of the said International Commission by the under-signed Francis Hemming, Secretary to the International Commission on Zoological Nomenclature, in virtue of all and every the powers conferred upon him in that behalf.

16. The present *Opinion* shall be known as *Opinion Three Hundred and Sixty (360)* of the International Commission on Zoological Nomenclature.

DONE in London, this Seventeenth day of February, Nineteen Hundred and Fifty-Five.

*Secretary to the International Commission
on Zoological Nomenclature*

FRANCIS HEMMING